

SUMMARY STATEMENT

1. My name is **Gavin Stanley**. I am a founding member, shareholder and Senior Quantity Surveyor at Rhodes + Associates Limited.
2. I have a BSc in Quantity Surveying and have worked as a Quantity Surveyor for 34 years for both contractors and in Private Practice, I have been involved with numerous Heritage projects both here and in the United Kingdom.
3. I have prepared evidence on behalf of the **Christchurch City Council (Council)** to provide comment on quotations and estimates provided by building owners and their representatives.
4. I have provided reports for the following five buildings:
 - 4.1 Former Dwelling and Setting – 32 Armagh Street; 325 Montreal Street:

In my evidence I updated my previous estimate dated 01 December 2015.

- a) In his evidence on behalf of Carter Group Limited, Mr Chatterton provided an estimate for this site which identified a substantially greater extent of works than that allowed within my original estimate.
- a) Mr Chatterton has based his estimate on a worst-case scenario which by definition considers all potential risks no matter how small or likely which has the effect of inflating the overall construction cost.
- b) I consider Mr Chatterton's estimate relies on inaccurate measures such as GFA, roof area and cladding area which has had the effect of increasing the estimate value.
- c) I have prepared a Schedule of Amendments based on comments made in my Rebuttal Evidence, excluding reference to betterment (**Appendix A**). This assumes the work items identified by Mr Chatterton are necessary (which may be a matter of dispute amongst the other experts).
- d) I have not addressed or adjusted the value of internal works as these would require assessment by the Councils experts to make comment on the state of repair and remedial works required which could be valued.
- e) Whilst producing the Schedule of Amendments I did identify another item of significant value concerning the reduction of the ground level with reference to the underfloor venting. I inspected the property again as the

area of 300 m² suggested by Mr Chatterton appeared excessive. I have subsequently allowed for the clearance of a 1000 mm border around the building which reduces the area of works to 57 m² and have accommodated the adjustment in the Schedule of Amendments.

- f) My Schedule of Amendments equates to a reduction of Mr Chatterton's estimate of \$1,452,000 by \$320,469 reducing Mr Chatterton's estimate to \$1,131,531, although this estimate could be reduced further once clarification is gained from Councils experts on the extent of internal works required and betterment is taken into account.
- g) The overall difference from my estimate dated 4 August 2023 of \$259,000 and Mr Chatterton's estimate incorporating my Schedule of Amendments of \$1,131,531 equates to \$872,531
- h) I have prepared a Schedule for Betterment Adjustments, based on my Rebuttal Evidence (**Appendix B**) which totals \$98,833.
- i) The overall difference from my estimate dated 4 August 2023 of \$259,000 and Mr Chatterton's estimate incorporating my 'Schedule of Amendments' and 'Betterment Adjustments' of \$1,032,698 equates to \$773,698

4.2 Dwelling, Daresbury and Setting – 9 Daresbury Lane, 67 and 67B Fendalton Road:

- a) As set out in my rebuttal evidence, I have considered the repair estimate prepared for this site by Mr Harrison on behalf of Daresbury Limited.
- b) I corrected my gross floor area in line with Mr Harrison's calculation and have used that within my revised calculations for alternative replacement buildings.
- c) I adjusted my fluctuation calculations to reflect new data from Stats NZ which had the effect of increasing Milne Construction's estimate. Mr Harrison agreed with the calculation being based on the contract NZS 3910:2013
- d) Mr Harrison had suggested a margin of 10%, I have left the margin as per Milne Constructions assessment of 7.5% which is reflected by the current market conditions.

- e) With reference to betterment, following information provided within Mr Harrison's report I agreed with his comments on the HVAC system but disagree to the extent of Fire System and Curtains, (although I have not adjusted Mr Harrison's figures).
- f) I have adjusted my Preliminary and General allowances although this is still a lower value than Mr Harrison's proposal.
- g) In summary:
 - (i) Both Mr Harrison's and my replacement replica costs match at \$8,712,000, however there is a difference between our repair estimates where my 'Repair Estimate Option 3 – Adjusted Option 2' is \$7,693,272 and Mr Harrison's estimate is \$8,127,788, a difference of \$434,516.
 - (ii) The differences between the repair estimate 'Option 3 – Adjusted Option 2' of \$7,693,272 and proposed modern structure replacement buildings ranging from \$7,623,000 and \$10,890,000 would either give a saving of \$70,272 or an extra over cost \$3,196,728.

4.3 Former Dwelling and Setting – 471 Ferry Road:

- a) I prepared a repair estimate for this site which is attached to my primary evidence. This provides a repair figure of \$705,000.

4.4 Mitre Hotel and Setting – 40 Norwich Quay, Lyttelton:

- a) I had reviewed costings provided and had allowed for escalation of costs given the date of the estimate, I am aware however that this building has now been demolished.

4.5 Commercial Building and Setting Harley Chambers – 137 Cambridge Terrace:

- a) I attended expert conferencing with Mr Pomeroy (Quantity Surveyor) for Cambridge 137 Limited, amongst other experts which was useful.
- b) I do not have any significant issues with Mr Pomeroy's original estimates where we do differ is the methodology for the calculation of escalation to bring the estimates up to date.
- c) In summary, the differences between Mr Pomeroy and myself are:

- (i) Building reinstatement and strengthening to 67% NBS, difference of \$2,157,273.
- (ii) Retaining historic façade, difference of \$588,031
- (iii) Additional repairs post August 2017, difference \$145,690.
- (iv) Building reinstatement and strengthening 67% NBS v New open plan office, saving between options \$9,615,071.
- (v) Building reinstatement and strengthening 67% NBS v New open plan office including façade retention, saving between options \$3,115,747.

Date: 28 November 2023

Gavin Stanley

325 MONTREAL STREET - SCHEDULE OF AMENDMENTS

| Ref | Description | TOM CHATTERTON - 20/09/2023 | | | | GAVIN STANLEY - 23/11/2023 | | | | Adjustment | Notes |
|--|---|-----------------------------|----------------|--------------|---------------------|----------------------------|----------------|--------------|---------------------|--------------------|---|
| | | Qty | Unit | Rate \$ | Total Cost \$ | Qty | Unit | Rate \$ | Total Cost \$ | | |
| SP Site Preparation | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Reduce levels around the building to expose sub floor vents | 300 | m ² | 30.00 | 9,000.00 | 57 | m ² | 30.00 | 1,710.00 | -7,290.00 | Revised area as per additional comments ¹ |
| 88 | Clear site of debris and hazardous material | 146 | m ² | 50.00 | 7,300.00 | 135 | m ² | 50.00 | 6,750.00 | -550.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 7 | Remove existing T&G floor boards and carefully store for reuse. | 146 | m ² | 20.00 | 2,920.00 | 135 | m ² | 20.00 | 2,700.00 | -220.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 18 | Remove existing roofing iron, | 217 | m ² | 30.00 | 6,510.00 | 190 | m ² | 30.00 | 5,700.00 | -810.00 | Reduced roofing area (Ref 37.b) |
| SB Substructure | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | Relevel foundations | 146 | m ² | 300.00 | 43,800.00 | 135 | m ² | 300.00 | 40,500.00 | -3,300.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 4 | Replace foundation stones to the east and north facades | 146 | m ² | 50.00 | 7,300.00 | 135 | m ² | 50.00 | 6,750.00 | -550.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 5 | 0.25 thick polythene to ground beneath the house | 146 | m ² | 5.00 | 730.00 | 135 | m ² | 5.00 | 675.00 | -55.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 6 | R1.3 Insulation to underside of house. | 146 | m ² | 30.00 | 4,380.00 | 135 | m ² | 30.00 | 4,050.00 | -330.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| FR Frame | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11 | Replace existing deteriorated timber joists and bearers | 146 | m ² | 150.00 | 21,900.00 | 135 | m ² | 150.00 | 20,250.00 | -1,650.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| RF Roof | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 19 | Replace roofing iron | 217 | m ² | 120.00 | 26,040.00 | 190 | m ² | 120.00 | 22,800.00 | -3,240.00 | Reduced roofing area (Ref 37.b) |
| 86 | EV for slate roofing | 217 | m ² | 200.00 | 43,400.00 | 0 | m ² | 200.00 | 0.00 | -43,400.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.c.i) |
| 20 | R6.0 Insulation to roof | 217 | m ² | 40.00 | 8,680.00 | 135 | m ² | 40.00 | 5,400.00 | -3,280.00 | Area reduced from roof to ceiling at corrected GFA (Ref 35.c.iv and 37.b) |
| 87 | Timber battens for slate roofing | 217 | m ² | 50.00 | 10,850.00 | 0 | m ² | 50.00 | 0.00 | -10,850.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.c.iii) |
| EW Exterior Walls and Exterior Finish | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 12 | Remove existing weatherboard assume 100% removal | 204 | m ² | 20.00 | 4,080.00 | 152 | m ² | 20.00 | 3,040.00 | -1,040.00 | Reduced weatherboarding area (Ref 37.c) |
| 13 | Install new weatherboards | 204 | m ² | 220.00 | 44,880.00 | 152 | m ² | 220.00 | 33,440.00 | -11,440.00 | Reduced weatherboarding area (Ref 37.c) |
| 25 | Install building paper | 204 | m ² | 20.00 | 4,080.00 | 152 | m ² | 20.00 | 3,040.00 | -1,040.00 | Reduced weatherboarding area (Ref 37.c) |
| 26 | R3.6 Insulation to external walls | 204 | m ² | 30.00 | 6,120.00 | 152 | m ² | 30.00 | 4,560.00 | -1,560.00 | Reduced weatherboarding area (Ref 37.c) |
| CD Ceiling Finishes | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 41 | Allow new 13mm GIB ceilings throughout, incl L4 stopped and painted | 146 | m ² | 85.00 | 12,410.00 | 135 | m ² | 85.00 | 11,475.00 | -935.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| 43 | New timber ceiling battens | 146 | m ² | 75.00 | 10,950.00 | 135 | m ² | 75.00 | 10,125.00 | -825.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| PB Sanitary Plumbing | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 55 | Hot and cold reticulation | 146 | m ² | 50.00 | 7,300.00 | 135 | m ² | 50.00 | 6,750.00 | -550.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| EL Electrical Services | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 62 | New wiring throughout | 146 | m ² | 50.00 | 7,300.00 | 135 | m ² | 50.00 | 6,750.00 | -550.00 | Reduced GFA (Ref 37.a) |
| XW Exterior Works | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 75 | General landscaping allowance | 300 | m ² | 150.00 | 45,000.00 | 57 | m ² | 150.00 | 8,550.00 | -36,450.00 | Revised area as per additional comments ¹ |
| MG Margins | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 78 | Margin | 1 | Item | 89,821.90 | 89,821.90 | 1 | Item | 76,830.40 | 76,830.40 | -12,991.50 | Reduced to 8% Margin (Ref 38) |
| NA Not Applicable | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 83 | Rounding | 1 | Item | -40.90 | -40.90 | 1 | Item | 0.00 | 0.00 | 40.90 | Omitted |
| ESTIMATED NET COST | | | \$/m2 | 6,767 | 988,000.00 | | \$/m2 | 6,260 | 845,134.40 | -142,865.60 | |
| MARGINS & ADJUSTMENTS | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Design Contingency | 5.0 % | | | 49,400.00 | 5.0 % | | | 42,256.72 | -7,143.28 | |
| | Construction Contingency | 15.0 % | | | 155,610.00 | 10.0 % | | | 88,739.11 | -66,870.89 | Reduced to 10% (Ref 39) |
| | Professional Fees | 15.0 % | | | 178,951.50 | 15.0 % | | | 146,419.53 | -32,531.97 | |
| | Building Consent | 0.8 % | | | 10,975.69 | 0.8 % | | | 8,980.40 | -1,995.29 | |
| | Heritage Works Contingency | 5.0 % | | | 69,146.86 | 0 % | | | 0.00 | -69,146.86 | Omitted (Ref 40) |
| | Rounding | 0.0 % | | | -84.05 | 0.0 % | | | 0.00 | 84.05 | Omitted |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL COST | | | \$/m2 | 9,945 | 1,452,000.00 | | \$/m2 | 8,382 | 1,131,530.16 | -320,469.84 | |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL COST (ROUNDED) | | | | | 1,452,000.00 | | | | 1,131,531.00 | -320,469.00 | |

| ESTIMATE COMPARISON (A) | TOM CHATTERTON - 20/09/2023 | TOM CHATTERTON - 20/09/2023 (Incorporating 'Schedule of Amendments') |
|---|-----------------------------|---|
| Estimate Total's | 1,452,000.00 | 1,131,531.00 |
| Less Rhodes & Associates Budget Repair Estimate R2 - 4 August 2023 | -259,000.00 | -259,000.00 |
| DIFFERENCE (A) | 1,193,000.00 | 872,531.00 |

Please note the following:

Only adjusted figures have been shown, where figures have not been adjusted they have been hidden for simplicity
All 'Ref' items refer to my rebuttal evidence

Note 1 - Allowance to clear a 1000 mm border around the perimeter of the building.

325 MONTREAL STREET - BETTERMENT ADJUSTMENT

TOM CHATTERTON - 20/09/2023
INCORPORATING SCHEDULE OF
AMENDMENTS

GAVIN STANLEY - 23/11/2023

| Ref | Description | Qty | Unit | Rate \$ | Total Cost \$ | Qty | Unit | Rate \$ | Total Cost \$ | Adjustment | Notes | |
|---------------------------------------|---|------|----------------|------------|-------------------|------|----------------|------------|------------------|------------------|---|--|
| SB | Substructure | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 6 | R1.3 Insulation to underside of house. | 135 | m ² | 30.00 | 4,050.00 | 0 | m ² | 30.00 | 0.00 | -4,050.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.a.ii) | |
| FT | Fittings and Fixtures | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 42 | Kitchen and Laundry Joinery | 1 | Item | 20,000.00 | 20,000.00 | 1 | Item | 5,000.00 | 5,000.00 | -15,000.00 | Adjusted (ref 35.i) | |
| 46 | Composite stone bench tops | 6 | m | 900.00 | 5,400.00 | 1 | No | 1,000.00 | 1,000.00 | -4,400.00 | Adjusted (ref 35.i) Small stainless steel worktop | |
| HV | Heating and Ventilation Services | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 80 | Heat pumps | 3 | No | 7,000.00 | 21,000.00 | 1 | No | 7,000.00 | 7,000.00 | -14,000.00 | Reduce to 1no (Ref 35.j.i) | |
| EL | Electrical Services | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 63 | New LED Recessed lights | 31 | No | 600.00 | 18,600.00 | 12 | No | 200.00 | 2,400.00 | -16,200.00 | Adjusted (ref 35.i) standard pendant light fittings | |
| 64 | New power outlets | 27 | No | 400.00 | 10,800.00 | 15 | No | 150.00 | 2,250.00 | -8,550.00 | Adjusted (ref 35.i) standard double socket | |
| SS | Special Services | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 66 | Broadband fibre connection | 1 | Item | 1,000.00 | 1,000.00 | 0 | Item | 1,000.00 | 0.00 | -1,000.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.k.i) | |
| 68 | Data outlets | 9 | No | 350.00 | 3,150.00 | 0 | No | 350.00 | 0.00 | -3,150.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.k.i) | |
| 69 | Security System | 1 | Item | 2,000.00 | 2,000.00 | 0 | Item | 2,000.00 | 0.00 | -2,000.00 | Omitted (Ref 35.k.i) | |
| MG | Margins | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 78 | Margin | 8.0 | % | 86,000.00 | 6,880.00 | 8.0 | % | 17,650.00 | 1,412.00 | -5,468.00 | Recalculation of percentage | |
| ESTIMATED NET COST | | | | | 92,880.00 | | | | | 19,062.00 | -73,818.00 | |
| MARGINS & ADJUSTMENTS | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Design Contingency | 5.0 | % | | 4,644.00 | 5.0 | % | | 953.10 | -3,690.90 | Recalculation of percentage | |
| | Construction Contingency | 10.0 | % | | 9,752.40 | 10.0 | % | | 2,001.51 | -7,750.89 | Recalculation of percentage | |
| | Professional Fees | 15.0 | % | | 16,091.46 | 15.0 | % | | 3,302.49 | -12,788.97 | Recalculation of percentage | |
| | Building Consent | 0.8 | % | | 986.94 | 0.8 | % | | 202.55 | -784.39 | Recalculation of percentage | |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL COST | | | | | 124,354.80 | | | | | 25,521.65 | -98,833.15 | |
| ESTIMATED TOTAL COST (ROUNDED) | | | | | 124,355.00 | | | | | 25,522.00 | -98,833.00 | |

| ESTIMATE ADJUSTMENT (Incorporating 'Schedule of Amendments' and 'Betterment Adjustment') | |
|--|---------------------|
| Tom Chatterton's Estimate - 20 September 2023 | 1,452,000.00 |
| Less Schedule of Amendments | -320,469.00 |
| Less Betterment Adjustment | -98,833.00 |
| REVISED TOTAL | 1,032,698.00 |

| REVISED ESTIMATE COMPARISON (B) | |
|--|-------------------|
| ESTIMATE ADJUSTMENT (Incorporating 'Schedule of Amendments' and 'Betterment Adjustment') | 1,032,698.00 |
| Less Rhodes & Associates Budget Repair Estimate R2 - 4 August 2023 | -259,000.00 |
| DIFFERENCE (B) | 773,698.00 |

Please note the following:

Only adjusted figures have been shown, where figures have not been adjusted they have been hidden for simplicity
All 'Ref' items refer to my rebutal evidence